
CRITIQUING THE INDIAN RAILWAYS: LEGAL, REGULATORY, AND POLICY PERSPECTIVES

Pratham Sanjay Gupta, Master's Student of Public Policy, St. Xavier's College, Mumbai

ABSTRACT

The Indian Railways, as the world's fourth-largest railway network, serves over 23 million passengers daily and underpins the nation's economic and social fabric. However, persistent safety lapses, regulatory bottlenecks, and violations of labor and passenger rights undermine its efficacy and accountability. This short article critiques these issues through a legal, regulatory, and policy lens, drawing on recent incidents such as the 29 consequential accidents reported between April and November 2024. It examines gaps in the Railways Act, 1989, and the delayed rollout of safety technologies like Kavach, alongside inefficiencies from political interference and inadequate privatization policies. Labor rights concerns, including denied breaks for loco pilots, and passenger grievances exceeding 61 lakh in two years highlight systemic failures. Interdisciplinary implications span economic losses (e.g., ₹30,000 crore annually) and social inequities. Recommendations include establishing an independent regulator, enforcing stricter accountability under tort law, and integrating technology with policy reforms. This analysis underscores the urgent need for holistic reforms to align Indian Railways with modern governance standards.

Keywords: Indian Railways, safety accountability, regulatory inefficiencies, labor rights, passenger rights, policy reforms, Kavach system

Introduction

The Indian Railways (IR) stands as a colossal infrastructure lifeline, transporting 8 billion passengers and 1.4 billion tonnes of freight annually, contributing approximately 1.5% to India's GDP. Yet, beneath this veneer of scale lies a network plagued by systemic vulnerabilities. In 2024 alone, IR recorded 29 consequential accidents resulting in loss of lives and property damage, underscoring a failure in legal and policy safeguards. Recent collisions, such as those highlighted in the Commission of Railway Safety's reports, reveal not isolated mishaps but entrenched issues in accountability and oversight.

This article critiques IR from multifaceted perspectives: legal accountability in safety protocols, regulatory inefficiencies stifling modernization, and violations of labor and passenger rights. It builds on prior research, including the author's preprint on IR safety metrics (ISSN: [Insert ISSN if available]), which quantifies accident trends over the past decade. By integrating legal analysis with policy evaluation, the piece advocates for targeted reforms to bolster credibility and efficiency. The discussion proceeds through key thematic sections, culminating in actionable recommendations.

Safety and Legal Accountability

Safety on IR tracks remains a paramount concern, with legal frameworks like the Railways Act, 1989, providing nominal protections that falter in enforcement. The Act mandates vicarious liability for the Union under Section 124A for passenger deaths or injuries due to negligence, yet prosecutions are rare. In 2024, systemic lapses like signal failures, track faults, and human error, contributed to over 500 accidents, as per the Controller and Auditor General (CAG) Report No. 9 of 2025. The delayed implementation of Kavach, an indigenous automatic train protection system, exemplifies this inertia; despite pilot successes, full deployment across 44,000 km of tracks lags, with only 1,465 km covered by mid-2025.

Legal accountability is further diluted by the absence of a robust compensation regime. While the Rail Accident Compensation Tribunal under Section 124B offers interim relief, claims often drag for years, eroding public trust. Judicial interventions, such as the Supreme Court's directive in *Union of India v. Prabhakaran*, emphasizes strict liability, but operational realities like understaffing and outdated signaling, persist. The 2024 Balasore tragedy's aftermath revealed procedural delays in investigations, highlighting the need for an independent safety commission insulated from ministerial influence. Drawing from the author's preprint, statistical

modeling shows a 15% rise in attributable fatalities due to regulatory non-compliance between 2020-2024.

To enhance accountability, IR must operationalize the Railways (Amendment) Bill, 2024, which repeals the archaic 1905 Act and introduces modern liability clauses. Without swift judicial reforms, safety remains a policy afterthought rather than a legal imperative.

Regulatory Inefficiencies

IR's regulatory architecture is marred by inefficiencies, primarily the lack of an independent regulator, a gap critiqued in multiple policy analyses. Political interference in fare fixation and resource allocation, as noted in the NITI Aayog's review of social service obligations, results in annual losses exceeding ₹30,000 crore. Fare structures, frozen since 2016, ignore cost recovery, leading to cross-subsidization where passenger services fund freight losses.

Privatization efforts under the General Manager model have yielded mixed results; while 151 trains were outsourced by 2025, operational inefficiencies persist due to fragmented oversight. The absence of a unified regulator allows excessive ministerial control, stifling investments in high-speed corridors and dedicated freight lines. Economic critiques, such as those in the Observer Research Foundation's 2025 report, point to overstaffing and procurement delays as key bottlenecks, with project execution rates hovering at 70%.

Policy-wise, the Union Budget 2024 allocated ₹2.62 lakh crore to IR, yet 40% remains unutilized due to regulatory hurdles. Integrating dynamic pricing principles, as proposed in recent Hindu Centre analyses, could mitigate these, but requires legislative backing. Absent such reforms, IR's monopoly structure perpetuates inefficiencies, undermining its role in India's logistics ecosystem.

Labor and Passenger Rights

IR's workforce of 1.2 million faces egregious rights violations, emblematic of broader policy neglect. Loco pilots, operating 13,000 trains daily, are denied mandatory meal and toilet breaks, contravening International Labour Organization standards and the Factories Act, 1948. A 2025 High Court petition highlighted fatigue-induced errors contributing to 20% of accidents, yet IR rejected the demand, citing operational constraints. Unions' protests against privatization further underscore job insecurity, with 35% of staff on contractual terms lacking parity in

wages or pensions.

Passenger rights fare no better. Over 61 lakh complaints flooded the Central Railway Helpline in 2023-24 and 2024-25, topping security and amenities issues. Violations under the Consumer Protection Act, 2019, include unclean facilities and arbitrary deboarding; a Visakhapatnam consumer forum fined IR ₹30,000 in 2024 for such lapses. The Railways (Manner of Use of Tracks) Rules, 2025, impose stricter penalties on passengers but evade reciprocal accountability for delays exceeding three hours, where refunds are mandated yet seldom processed. Rights to confirmed seating and medical aid, enshrined in IR's Passenger Charter, remain aspirational amid overcrowding.

These breaches not only infringe fundamental rights under Article 21 of the Constitution but also exacerbate social inequities, disproportionately affecting migrant laborers and low-income travelers.

Interdisciplinary Implications

IR's challenges transcend law, intersecting economics, sociology, and environmental policy. Economically, inefficiencies inflate logistics costs by 14% above global averages, hampering GDP growth as per a 2024 ResearchGate study spanning 1995-2021. Socially, the network reinforces urban-rural divides; colonial-era routes, critiqued in historical analyses, perpetuate access disparities for marginalized communities. Environmentally, diesel dependency contributes 5% to national emissions, yet green corridor policies lag.

Interdisciplinary lenses reveal IR as a socio-economic barometer: NITI Aayog's 2016 report on social obligations estimates ₹68,000 crore in implicit subsidies, distorting market dynamics. Integrating legal reforms with economic modeling e.g., cost-benefit analyses of Kavach could yield multiplier effects, boosting employment and equity. As the author's preprint illustrates through econometric simulations, addressing these could reduce accident-related GDP losses by 0.2% annually.

Conclusion and Recommendations

IR's triad of safety lapses, regulatory voids, and rights violations demands urgent, integrated action. To forge a resilient network, policymakers must prioritize: (1) Enacting an Independent Rail Regulator Act to curb interference; (2) Mandating Kavach rollout by 2027 with penal

clauses under the amended Railways Act; (3) Amending labor rules for pilot rest periods and full contractual parity; (4) Digitizing passenger grievance redressal with auto-refunds; and (5) Adopting dynamic pricing tied to inflation indices.

These tactical reforms, grounded in legal-policy synergy, promise rapid gains in accountability and efficiency. For a CV-building publication like this, they affirm IR's reform potential while spotlighting actionable scholarship. Swift implementation could transform IR from a colonial relic into a 21st-century powerhouse.

References

1. Ministry of Railways, *Annual Report 2024-25* (Govt. of India 2025).
2. The Hindu Centre, *Indian Railways: Prioritising Safety on the Tracks* (Dec. 24, 2024), <https://www.thehinducentre.com/publications/policy-watch/indian-railways-prioritising-safety-on-the-tracks/article69018455.ece>.
3. PMF IAS, *Railway Safety in India: Lapses & Key Recommendations* (Apr. 11, 2025), <https://www.pmfias.com/railway-safety-in-india/>.
4. Pratham Gupta, *Preprint on Safety Metrics in Indian Railways* (Preprint, ISSN: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=5531987), cited in econometric models of accident trends.
5. Railways Act, 1989, § 124A, No. 24 of 1989.
6. Comptroller and Auditor General of India, *Report No. 9 of 2025: Union Government Ministry of Railways* (Aug. 1, 2025).
7. StudyIQ, *Indian Railways Safety Challenges, Concerns and Suggestions* (Jun. 25, 2024), <https://www.studyiq.com/articles/indian-railways-safety-challenges/>.
8. Railways Act, 1989, § 124B.
9. *Union of India v. Prabhakaran*, (2008) 1 SCC 286.
10. The Wire, *'Alarming' Railway Accidents: 11 Groups Issue Scathing Statement* (Jul. 20, 2024), <https://m.thewire.in/article/government/railway-organisations-trade-unions-safety-ashwini-vaishnaw>.
11. Supra note 4.
12. The Railways (Amendment) Bill, 2024, Bill No. 123 of 2024 (introduced Aug. 9, 2024).
13. Observer Research Foundation, *Private Participation in Indian Railways: A Policy Perspective* (Sep. 5, 2025), <https://www.orfonline.org/research/private-participation-in-indian-railways-a-policy-perspective-on-challenges-and-opportunities>.
14. NITI Aayog, *Reviewing the Impact of Social Service Obligations by Indian Railways* (2016), summarized in PRS India, <https://prsindia.org/policy/report-summaries/report-of-the-niti-aayog-on-reviewing-the-impact-of-social-service-obligations-by-indian-railways-4440-260>.
15. The Hindu Centre, *Indian Railways: Why New Pricing Principles Matter* (Jan. 28, 2025), <https://www.thehinducentre.com/the-arena/current-issues/indian-railways-why-new-pricing-principles-matter/article69127047.ece>.

16. International Journal of Research Publication and Reviews, *Challenges and Reforms in Indian Railways: A Critical Analysis* (2024), <https://ijrpr.com/uploads/V6ISSUE3/IJRPR40008.pdf>.
17. Wright Research, *Chapter 6: Challenges & Outlook of Indian Railways Sector in 2024* (Aug. 2, 2024), <https://www.wrightresearch.in/encyclopedia/chapter-report/chapter-6-challenges-and-outlook-of-indian-railways-sector-in-2024/>.
18. Supra note 13.
19. Business Standard, *Union Budget 2024: India's Rail Safety in Focus* (Jun. 20, 2024), https://www.business-standard.com/budget/news/union-budget-2024-india-s-rail-safety-in-focus-after-recent-collisions-124062000483_1.html.
20. Supra note 15.
21. The Hindu, *Indian Railways Says No to Meals and Toilet Breaks for Loco Pilots* (Apr. 9, 2025), <https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/indian-railways-says-no-to-meals-and-toilet-breaks-for-loco-pilots/article69426961.ece>.
22. Peoples Democracy, *Railway Unions Unite Against Privatisation* (Apr. 13, 2025), https://peoplesdemocracy.in/2025/0413_pd/railway-unions-unite-against-privatisation-demand-safety-and-restoration-workers-rights.
23. Factories Act, 1948, § 66(1)(b).
24. NDTV, *Railways Flooded With Over 61 Lakh Passenger Complaints* (Sep. 27, 2025), <https://www.ndtv.com/india-news/indian-railways-flooded-with-over-61-lakh-passenger-complaints-in-2-years-security-tops-list-9354252>.
25. LiveMint, *Indian Railways Asked to Pay ₹30,000 in Damages* (Nov. 1, 2024), <https://www.livemint.com/news/india/indian-railways-asked-to-pay-rs-30-000-to-passenger-over-dirty-toilet-lack-of-basic-amenities-report-11730453175987.html>.
26. Consumer Protection Act, 2019, No. 35 of 2019.
27. Economic Times, *5 Rights You Have as a Passenger on Indian Railways* (Apr. 2, 2023), <https://m.economictimes.com/industry/transportation/railways/5-rights-you-have-as-a-passenger-on-indian-railways/rules-and-regulations/slideshow/99177311.cms>.
28. ResearchGate, *Railways and Economic Indicators: Analyzing Growth Patterns in India* (Oct. 24, 2024), https://www.researchgate.net/publication/385179293_Railways_and_Economic_Indicators_Analyzing_Growth_Patterns_in_India.
29. ScienceDirect, *Railways and Cities in India* (2022), <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304387822001808>.

30. Asian Development Bank, *Speed and Socioeconomic Development: Influence of Indian Railways* (undated), <https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/503516/adbi-wp952.pdf>.
31. Supra note 14.
32. Supra note 4.
33. Id.